Consultation response

Part 1: Your details

Original language of response: English

Name: Anonymous

Country of residence: Ukraine

Are you willing to let us publish your response publicly on the Global Tailings Review website? Yes

Please select which stakeholder group you are representing: Academic (universities and other research institutes)

If 'Other', please specify below:

Are you responding on behalf of an organization? No

Please give the name of the organization:

Your level within the organisation:

Part 2: Your views on each of the Principles and Requirements in the Standard

Topic I: Knowledge Base

Principle 1

In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 1 do your comments relate to?

Your comments on Principle 1

Principle 2

In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 2 do your comments relate to?

Your comments on Principle 2

Topic II: Affected Communities

Principle 3

In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Partially

Which aspects of Principle 3 do your comments relate to?
Requirement 3.2
Your comments on Principle 3
PAP are usually not the experts to understand the difference among various technical solutions.

Topic III: Design, Construction, Operation and Monitoring of the Tailings Facility

Principle 4
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Partially

Which aspects of Principle 4 do your comments relate to?
Comments on the Principle itself

Your comments on Principle 4
Relevant technical standards (f.i. ISO) should be mentioned in this document

Principle 5
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 5 do your comments relate to?

Your comments on Principle 5

Principle 6
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 6 do your comments relate to?

Your comments on Principle 6:

Principle 7
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Partially

Which aspects of Principle 7 do your comments relate to?
Requirement 7.1

Your comments on Principle 7
This is one of the most important requirements but formulated quite general. Needs to be explained in more details.

Principle 8
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 8 do your comments relate to?
Topic IV: Management and Governance

Principle 9
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes
Which aspects of Principle 9 do your comments relate to?
Your comments on Principle 9

Principle 10
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes
Which aspects of Principle 10 do your comments relate to?
Your comments on Principle 10:

Principle 11
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes
Which aspects of Principle 11 do your comments relate to?
Your comments on Principle 11:

Principle 12
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes
Which aspects of Principle 12 do your comments relate to?
Your comments on Principle 12:

Principle 13
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes
Which aspects of Principle 13 do your comments relate to?
No
Your comments on Principle 13:
Principle 14
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 14 do your comments relate to?
Requirement 14.2

Your comments on Principle 14:
Highly important!

Topic V: Emergency Response and Long-Term Recovery
Principle 15
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 15 do your comments relate to?
Comments on the Principle itself

Your comments on Principle 15:
Harmonizing External ERP developed by authorities and Internal ERP developed by the operator

Principle 16
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 16 do your comments relate to?

Your comments on Principle 16:

Topic VI: Public Disclosure and Access to Information
Principle 17
In your view, will compliance with this Principle and its Requirements contribute to the prevention of catastrophic failure of tailings facilities?
Yes

Which aspects of Principle 17 do your comments relate to?

Your comments on Principle 17:

Part 3: Your views on the Standard
Your view as to whether the content of the Standard meets your expectations
3: Meets my expectations

Please summarize why you chose this option:
The Standard is a proper document but looks quite general. Adding references to existing technical standards and best available practice is recommended.

Your view on whether the Standard will create a step change for the industry in the safety and security of tailings facilities

Your view on whether the Standard will create a step change for the industry in the safety and security of tailings facilities (closed question):
3: Will strengthen some but not all aspects of the safety and security of tailings facilities

Please summarize why you chose this option:
The expected positive effect will be global dissemination of BAT and BREF. But the Standard mostly ignores the critical role of the state in some countries (former USSR, China) that is actually establishing the rules in environmental management to be kept by TMS operators. It should be clearly written in what way the Standard will be implemented and which actions have to be taken for this.

Does the content of the Standard address all aspects of tailings facility management adequately?

Does the content of the Standard address all aspects of tailings facility management adequately (closed question)?
No

Please explain why and/or what is missing:
Different principles have different significance. It makes sense to mention that some of them (f.i. Principles 7, 8 etc.) are of higher importance to really prevent from accidents.

Part 4: Suggestions for topics to be included in the accompanying Recommendations Report

On which topics would you expect to have further clarification or guidance in this document?
Principles 7 and 8 are of critical importance for preventing the failures and should be updated with the best technical standards, approaches, or recommendations to follow. The examples of guidance or checklists should be mentioned, for example, the UNECE Safety Guidelines and Good Practices for TMFs, developed by the Joint Expert Group on water and industrial accidents of UNECE, the related TMF Checklist and Methodology developed by UBA (Germany) under the Industrial Accidents Convention as a legal tool to address tailings safety. The text of the Russian version needs to be improved to correspond the English version.

Other information

Non-fitting response text (text submitted which did was not in response to one of the questions above)

Attachment 1 reference (if applicable)